

Ed Smith
CLERK OF THE SUPREME COURT
STATE OF MONTANA

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA

Cause No.:	
STATE OF MONTANA, EX REL. DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY,	
PLAINTIFF / APPELLANT,	FILED
v.	SEP 1 4 2009
BNSF RAILWAY COMPANY,	Ed Smith
DEFENDANT / APPELLEE,	OLEME OF THE SUPREME COURT STATE OF MONTANA
NOTICE OF APPEAL	

Appearances:

R. Allan Payne
Marc G. Buyske
DONEY CROWLEY BLOOMQUIST
PAYNE UDA PC
Diamond Block, Suite 200
44 West 6th Avenue
P.O. Box 1185
Helena, MT 59624-1185
Telephone: (406) 443-2211
Facsimile: (406) 449-8443
Email: rpayne@doneylaw.com

Attorneys for Appellant

Cynthia D. Brooks
Special Assistant Attorney General
MONTANA DEPARTMENT OF
ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY
1100 North Last Chance Gulch
P.O. Box 200901
Helena, MT 59620-0901
Telephone: (406) 841-5020
Facsimile: (406) 841-5050
Email: cbrooks@mt.gov

Attorney for Appellant

Leo Berry / Oliver H. Goe / Mark D. Etchart / Chad E. Adams BROWNING, KALECZYC, BERRY & HOVEN, P.C. 825 Great Northern Blvd., Suite 105 Helena, MT 59601

Telephone: (406) 443-6820 Facsimile: (406) 43-6895

Attorneys for Appellee

Paul J. Lawrence KIRKPATRICK & LOCKHART PRESTON GATES ELLIS, LLP 925 Fourth Avenue Suite 2900 Seattle, WA 98104-1158 Telephone: (206) 623-7580

Facsimile: (206) 623-7022

Attorneys for Appellee

On Appeal from the First Judicial District Court, Lewis and Clark County The Honorable Jeffrey M. Sherlock, Presiding District Court Cause No. BDV 2004-596

_____, Clerk

NOTICE is given that STATE OF MONTANA, EX REL. DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY, the Appellant above-named and Plaintiff in that cause of action filed in the First Judicial District, in and for the County of Lewis and Clark, as Cause No. BDV-2004-596, hereby appeals to the Supreme Court of the State of Montana from the following portions of the final judgments or orders entered in such action:

- 1. The conclusion of law that apportionment is available as a defense to actions under Montana's Comprehensive Environmental Cleanup and Responsibility Act ("CECRA"), Mont. Code Ann. §§ 75-10-701 et seq. See, Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Order, dated February 10, 2009, pp. 22-23, ¶¶ 15-16.
- 2. The conclusion of law that Defendant's abatement of the contamination from the subject facilities ordered by the District Court under CECRA authority (Mont. Code Ann. § 75-10-711(8)) does not require compliance with the Plaintiff's Record of Decision ("ROD") KRY Site, Kalispell, Montana, issued June 2008, under Plaintiff's CECRA authority (Mont. Code Ann. §§ 75-10-721) until that ROD has been approved by a Court. *See*, Final Unified Abatement Order, dated August 13, 2009, p. 3, ll. 12-14.

- 3. The denial of Plaintiff's claim of public nuisance. *See*, Order on Pre-Trial Motions, dated February 15, 2008.
- 4. The District Court conclusion in ¶ 2 of its Final Unified Abatement Order that Defendant BNSF Railway Company was ready, willing, and able to conduct the abatement under CECRA is not supported by a finding of fact or the factual record.
- 5. The Court's evidentiary decision at trial allowing Mr. Pat Keim to provide expert witness testimony. *See*, Trial Transcript, p. 1232 l. 15 through p. 1236 l. 14.

THE APPELLANT FURTHER CERTIFIES:

- 1. That this appeal is not subject to the mediation process required by M.R.App.P. 7.
- 2. That this appeal is not an appeal from an order certified as final under M.R.Civ.P. 54(b).
- 3. That the notice required by M.R.App.P. 27 is not applicable in this appeal;

- 4. That all available transcripts of the proceedings in this cause have been ordered from the court reporter contemporaneously with the filing of this Notice of Appeal.
- 5. The Appellant is a governmental entity not required to pay fees pursuant to Mont. Code Ann. § 25-10-405.

DATED this 14th day of September, 2009.

R. Allan Payne

Marc G. Buyske

Attorneys for Appellant

DONEY CROWLEY BLOOMQUIST PAYNE UDA P.C.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have filed a true and accurate copy of the foregoing Notice of Appeal with the Clerk of the Montana Supreme Court; and that I have served true and accurate copies of the foregoing Notice of Appeal upon the Clerk of the District Court, each attorney of record, and each party not represented by an attorney in the above-referenced District Court action, as follows:

Nancy Sweeney, Clerk of District Court Montana First Judicial District Court Lewis and Clark County P.O. Box 158 Helena, MT 59624-0158

Cynthia D. Brooks
Montana Department of Environmental Quality
Remediation Division
P.O. Box 200901
Helena, MT 59620-0901
Attorney for Appellant DEQ

Leo Berry / Oliver H. Goe / Mark D. Etchart / Chad E. Adams Browning, Kaleczyc, Berry & Hoven, P.C. PO Box 1697 Helena, MT 59624 Attorney for Appellee BNSF Railway Company

Paul J. Lawrence
Kirkpatrick & Lockhart Preston Gates Ellis, LLP
925 Fourth Avenue Suite 2900
Seattle, WA 98104-1158
Attorney for Appellee BNSF Railway Company

Karl K. Rudbach
Kaufman, Vidal, Hileman & Ramlow, P.C.
22 Second Avenue West, Suite 4000
P.O. Box 728
Kalispell, MT 59903-0728
Attorney for Kalispell Pole & Timber Company

Stephen H. Foster / Shane Coleman / Kyle A. Gray Holland & Hart, LLP 401 North 31st Street, Suite 1500 P.O. Box 639 Billings, MT 59103-0639 Attorney for Exxon Mobile Corporation

Gregory A. Van Horssen
Keller, Reynolds, Drake, Johnson & Gillespie, P.C.
Guardian Bldg., Third Floor
50 South Last Chance Gulch
P.O. Box 598
Helena, MT 59624
Attorney for Montana Mokko, Incorporated

Paul A. Sandry
Johnson, Berg, McEvoy & Bostock, PPLP
221 First Avenue East
P.O. Box 3038
Kalispell, MT 59903-3038
Attorney for Klingler Lumber Company, Inc. and Swank Enterprises

Tommy Butler
Montana Dept. of Natural Resources & Conservation
1625 Eleventh Ave.
P.O. Box 201601
Helena, MT 59620-1601
Attorney for DNRC

DATED this 14th day of September, 2009.

DONEY CROWLEY BLOOMQUIST PAYNE UDA P.C.

Diamond Block, Suite 200

44 West 6th Avenue

P.O. Box 1185

Helena, MT 59624-1185

R. Allan Payne

Marc G. Buyske

Attorneys for Appellant